

Innovative Initiatives to Expand the Effects of Savings Groups towards Financial Inclusion

Annexes to the Preliminary Research Report

June 2014



**The MasterCard
Foundation**

Table of Contents - Annexes

Annex 1: Schedule of Activities	2
Annex 2: Hypotheses Matrix.....	3
Annex 3: Senior Staff Interviews.....	6
Annex 4: Focus Group Discussion Guide (example).....	9
Annex 5: List of initiatives found through preliminary search	11
Annex 6: Materials Consulted	24

Annex 1: Schedule of Activities

Activity	# Days Team Leader	# Days Senior Researcher	# Days Analyst	W 1 FEB 16-22	W 2 FEB 23 – MAR 1	W 3 MAR 2-8	W 4 MAR9 -15	W 5 MAR1 6-22	W 6 MAR2 3-29	W 7 MAR3 0- APR 5	W 8 APR 6-12	W9 APR 13-19	W10 APR 20-26	W 11 APR 27 – MAY 3	W12 MAY 4-10	W 13 MAY 11-17	W14 MAY 18-24	W16 MAY 25-31	W17 JUN 1-6	W 18 JUN 7-14
Kick-off meeting	1	1		█	█															
Literature review and literature case studies on relevant experiences	4	3		█	█	█	█													
Early interviews with pivotal persons (e.g. CARE Access Africa)	1			█	█	█														
Inventorying all initiatives and experiences and exploring suitability and further research interests (email and telephone contacting)	1	2	2	█	█	█														
Inception report: Detailed research proposal	3		1		█	█														
Designing the field-research tools (qualitative) and data processing tools					█	█														
Designing and circulating email-based multiple choice survey to senior staff	2				█	█	█													
Planning field work, making appointments, schedules, writing briefs	1		3				█	█	█											
Interviewing senior staff of impl. orgs.	3						█	█	█											
Designing self-implemented survey tool	3					█	█	█												
Organizing and supervising the self-impl. survey	4							█	█	█	█	█	█	█						
Finalizing research tools for field work according to initiatives selected for study								█	█											
Field work to 1 initiative of 1 week in Ghana	0.25	6								█										
Field work to 1 initiative of 1 week in Ghana	0.25	6									█									
Field work to 1 initiative of 1 week in Kenya	0.25		6									█								
Field work to 1 initiative of 1 week in Tanz.	0.25		6										█							
Field-work reports		2	2								█	█	█	█						
Analyzing data resulting from the quantitative survey conducted by impl. orgs.	3														█					
Preparing draft report	5	3	2												█	█				
Review and response week																█				
Discussing changes with MCF and final report preparation	2																█			
Preparation of presentation at workshop	1																		█	
Conducting presentation at workshop (incl. travel)	2	2																		█
Total days	37	25	22																	

█ Desk work

█ MCF response time

█ Field-work

Annex 2: Hypotheses Matrix

Dimension	Hypothesis	Implications for future action, if hypothesis confirmed	Research tool(s) ¹
Financial inclusion and bank or mobile money linkages	Financial literacy of linked groups is higher.	Bank-linked or mobile-money linked groups are likely to have a greater impact on group members as compared with the non-linked groups, namely enhanced financial skills among group members.	Literature review, field research staff interviews, field research groups & members, self-implemented surveys
	Members of linked groups have a more positive view of formal financial institutions.	Other studies suggest that members of groups that have become financially included have fewer barriers to stepping onto a financial inclusion “escalator”	Literature review, field research staff interviews, field research groups & members (by <i>MicroSave</i> and by implementing organisations),
	Number of group members with an individual bank account is higher among groups that are bank linked or m-money linked.	When the groups become financially included, this means also more financial inclusion at the individual level.	Literature review, field research staff interviews, field research groups & members, self-implemented surveys
	Number of group members with an individual bank account/m-wallet is higher among groups that are m-money linked than bank-linked.	When groups are linked to the m-money platform, group members are likely to join the m-money platform as individuals.	Self-implemented surveys, Field research with purposively selected groups
	Group members perceive depositing in a linked group as safer than in a group without a bank linkage	Bank or m-money-linked groups infuse group members with more confidence. This can potentially attract additional members who are currently cynical/worried about safety of savings in the SG.	Literature review, field research staff interviews, field research groups & members, self-implemented surveys
	Savings levels in linked groups are higher than with groups that are not linked	Members’ savings grow due to confidence in the SG. More savings are out of temptation’s way and more funds are available for lending within the group.	Literature review, MIS of organisations (through senior staff interviews), field research staff interviews, field research groups & members, self-implemented surveys
	Technology use	Group members using technological applications feel comfortable with technology tools such as mobile phones, and tablets.	Organizations may feel less inhibited about using different forms of technology with group members. At the moment they are holding back thinking that less educated people have more challenges with technology.
Group members can explain the benefits of the		Group members are more aware of benefits of	Literature review, field-research staff interviews, field-research

¹ Tools to be used are: literature review, organisation survey, senior staff Skype interviews, field research staff interviews, field research groups & members, self-implemented surveys.

Dimension	Hypothesis	Implications for future action, if hypothesis confirmed	Research tool(s) ¹
	<p>technology the SG uses.</p> <p>Group members can outline how the technological application(s) improve(s) their group workings.</p>	<p>technological applications than is currently thought. They can potentially make active choices between different technological options, if offered. N.B. choice of technology will remain difficult at the moment of first introduction when there is not yet any experience among the members.</p>	<p>groups & members, self-implemented surveys</p>
	<p>Group members are prepared to pay a fee for the technology tool, upon proof of being useful to group members.</p>	<p>Technological tools provide new opportunities for financial self-sustainability within the savings-group movement. If groups start paying very small fees for technology (e.g. e-recording) this will mean an income to the e-recording provider over a long period of time, because the groups are likely to use the application for many years after the first cycle. Groups may not want to pay for first year activities, like group-formation, after the first cycle.</p>	<p>Literature review, senior staff interviews, field research staff interviews, field research groups & members, self-implemented surveys</p>
	<p>Cost of achieving a level of impact is lower for groups adopting technology relative to those using manual approaches.</p>	<p>Organizations can more actively design a technology-based SG methodology. At the moment, cost-factors are often mentioned as a reason to steer clear of technology.</p>	<p>Literature review, senior staff interviews, field research staff interviews, field research groups & members, self-implemented surveys</p>
Efficiency and scaling	<p>Quality of the groups formed and supported with lower cost/efficient approaches are comparable to the more costly forms (some elements are better, some are weaker).</p>	<p>Some group formation approaches are costly. However, group-quality proxy indicators include, awareness/adherence to group rules, average cycle-attendance rate, number of cycles completed, changes in-group leadership and may possibly be achieved with the aid of technology.</p>	<p>Literature review, senior staff interviews, field-research staff interviews, field-research groups & members, self-implemented surveys.</p>
	<p>More cost-effective approaches of forming and supporting groups give members a greater level of control and autonomy.</p>	<p>While more viral approaches to group-formation may result in less homogeneous groups, group members have a greater sense of control and are even more autonomous than in the more traditionally formed groups.</p>	<p>Literature review, senior staff interviews, field research staff interviews, field research groups & members, self-implemented surveys.</p>
	<p>Spreading of SGs is more</p>	<p>The lower-cost forms of</p>	<p>Literature review, senior staff</p>

Dimension	Hypothesis	Implications for future action, if hypothesis confirmed	Research tool(s) ¹
	reliable, automatic and fast with efficient approaches to forming and supporting groups.	growing the savings movement are more likely to go “viral,” i.e. to spread independently of external support.	interviews, field research staff interviews, field research groups & members, self-implemented surveys.
	More distant and otherwise hard to reach persons are more effectively reached with efficient (e.g. widely available - ubiquitous) approaches than the traditional approaches.	The more efficient approaches will work better in minority populations or culturally plural societies.	Literature review, senior staff interviews, field research staff interviews, field research groups & members, self-implemented surveys.
	With efficient approaches, cost per group-member will be lower than USD10 (calculated over the longer term) for same-quality groups.	Complete coverage of the world’s 2.5 billion poor would cost only 25 billion USD. (Currently, the EU’s international development budget, for example, is 960 billion EUR annually).	Literature review, Savix data: Sample analysis, interviews with researchers into SG.
Crosscutting issues	When combining different approaches deeper effects and further efficiency of SGs can be achieved than is currently the case.	The next wave of innovation may simply focus on finding the right combinations of existing innovations to achieve the goals.	Literature review, interviews with researchers, senior staff interviews.
	A wider range of institutions is interested in stimulating SGs, including private sector institutions.	Scale may be achieved by supporting the private sector institutions to stimulate SG formation.	Literature review, interviews with researchers, senior staff interviews.

Annex 3: Senior Staff Interviews

Name	Organisation	Inter-viewed ²
Christian Loupeda	Freedom from Hunger	Yes
Kathleen Stack	Freedom from Hunger	Yes
Steve Hollingworth	Freedom from Hunger	Yes
Guy Vanmeenen	Catholic Relief Services	Yes
Marc Bavois	Catholic Relief Services	Yes
Lauren Hendricks	CARE Access Africa	Yes
Sybil Chidiac	CARE Access Africa	Yes
Gifty Blekpe	CARE Ghana	Yes
Henry Mutabazi	CARE Uganda	
Nelly Otieno	CARE Kenya	
Maude Massu	CARE UK/ Banking on Change	
John Schiller	Plan US	Yes
Sietske van der Ploeg	Plan UK	
Stella Tungaraza	Plan Tanzania	
Joanna Melymuk	Plan Canada	
Juan Pablo Garzon	Fundación Plan Colombia	Yes
Pascasie Nsanzabozwa	World Relief East Africa	Yes
Courtney O'Connell	World Relief East Africa	Yes
Sophie Romana	Oxfam America	Yes
Anton Krone	SaveAct South Africa	Yes
Mark Staele	Aga Khan Foundation	Yes
Andrew Doty	Village Enterprise	Yes
Konstantin Zvereff	Village Enterprise	Yes
Jill Thompson	Pendulosa Savings	
Hugh Allen	VSL Associates	Yes
John Rippey	PDX	Yes
Olga Morawczynski	Grameen Foundation	Yes
Camila Nestor	Grameen Foundation	
Caitlin Burton	Grameen Foundation	
Lisa Kienzle	Grameen Foundation	Yes
Daryl Collins	Bankable Frontier Associates	Yes
Julie Zolman	Bankable Frontier Associates/ FSD-K	
Eloisa Devietti	SEEP Network	
Isaac Holly	MicroSave Uganda (ex Airtel)	Yes
Mike McCaffrey	MicroSave, Manager of "Agent Network Acceleration" project	Yes
Courtenay Cabot Venton	One Hen Inc. Also a consultant	Yes
Celestin Gatera	Small Savings for Bigger Impact	
Kuria Wanjau	FSD Kenya	Yes
Henry Njoroge	FSD Kenya	
Amrik	FSD Kenya	
Pamela Eser	UNCDF	
Ivana Damjanov	UNCDF	
Hermann Messan	UNCDF	
Andrea Reyes	Inter American Development Bank	
Marc Ross	Vision Finance	
Dr. William Derban	Fidelity Bank	
Nanah Botsio	Fidelity Bank	Yes

² Where "yes" was written, an interview of at least one hour was held via Skype. In other cases an email or other exchange took place.

Name	Organisation	Inter-viewed ²
Michael Kaddu	Barclays Bank, Uganda	
Munir Duri	Kifiya Financial Technology	
Myriam Said, Yodit Zenebe, Abel Solomon	Kifiya Financial Technology	Yes
Geraldine O’Keeffe	Software Group	Yes
Michiel Wolvers	e-kulki	Yes
Susan Johnson	University of Bath	
Luz Salas	New York City University	
Anuj Jain	Coady Institute	Yes

Interview Questions

Senior staff interviews³ by Skype:

1. Innovations, there is a range of innovations ongoing, which do you personally regard as having the most potential?
2. Are there also risks involved with these innovations? Do you have some reservations about certain innovations?
3. Efficiency: What do you consider a feasible cost per member? Do you feel that lowering cost per member continuously also lowers the quality? What are minimum elements required to maintain the quality?
4. Bank/FI linkages: Does your organisation have any policy/ vision about linking groups to banks or other FIs? Do you feel that these linkages provide large strides forward in financial inclusion? Are bank linkages important for the convenience of the group or important for furthering people’s financial inclusion?
5. Technology: Have you had any negative experiences with technology? Which? What are the main barriers for your organization using more technology? (E. g. lack of organizational will/lack of skills or understanding/ costs / the partnerships it requires, etc) Are there aspects of SGs that are “holy” and cannot be done with technology or communications?
6. Support: For your organization to develop its innovations, what is required? What are the biggest challenges? How do you plan to overcome these?
7. Working with other organizations: For technology and bank linkages the original proponents of SGs, international NGOs, have to collaborate with actors of the private sector, e.g. software companies, telecom firms, banks. What are your experiences working with private sector?
8. The cooperation within the SG sector: What are your benefits from the exchange and dialogue happening in the SG sector? Do you benefit from it? Do you feel that organizations are willing to share and adopt each others’ tools and systems? What is needed to further this cooperation?
9. Role for MCF: What role could MCF play in the space of SGs. Is their role only funding related or does such a Foundation have other contributions to make?

Specific questions developed for SaveAct in South Africa who have developed a comprehensive financial education system that they offer together with the groups. They are planning to work on

³ For almost all the interviews, specific questions were developed according to the type of initiatives they have and their role in the SG space. Some examples of these additional specific questions are at the end of this document.

mobile-phone messages to complement the financial education:

1. So, the innovation that you have particularly focused on was on financial education. Why did you focus on this? Why was this priority?
2. To which of our 3 dimensions do you think your innovation makes biggest contributions, a. financial inclusion/bank linkages, b. efficiency, c. technology use?
3. What does SaveAct do about stimulating the groups to do financial linkages, e.g. with banks? With mobile money? If SaveAct does not stimulate, do groups also take the initiative to make that linkage?
4. Your groups that have enjoyed financial education, how are they different from groups without this education? What is the main impact?
5. You mentioned wanting to develop SMS messages for mobile phones to strengthen the financial education. Why did you decide this?
6. To what extent do you think technology could take over the personal financial education that you currently offer?
7. How will you go about developing the technology part of this? Are you doing it inhouse? Working with a technology company? If the latter, what is your experience so far?

Specific questions developed for WorldRelief who have groups that spontaneously link to financial institutions, primarily SACCOs:

1. So, your groups are independently linking to financial institutions. Why do you think the groups do this?
2. How common do you think this linkage is? Could you give us a broad estimation of the percentage of groups that link?
3. You told us that you won't yourself actively stimulate the groups to link, WR has the vision that groups should make that decision and act independently. Could you explain a bit more this vision of WR? What is it that WR wants to avoid when it would get involved?
4. In Rwanda groups could also link with mobile-money. Does that happen also? What do you think is the reason more groups link to financial institutions?

Annex 4: Focus Group Discussion Guide (example)

Focus Group Discussions with Savings Groups		Theme: Technology	Name Innovation: e-recording
Date:	Number of participants:		
Partner:	Study location:		
Hypotheses to test (still check formulation)	<i>Probe questions</i>		<i>Notes</i>
1. Group members feel comfortable with technology tools such as mobile phones, and tablets.	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. <i>Who has a phone?</i> b. <i>Who has no phone?</i> c. <i>How do you use the phone?(Stimulate discussion. Try to get some people to give different opinions, e.g. one says they use it only for receiving calls, then check if the others also make calls, then probe after SMS.)</i> d. <i>Those without a phone, do you sometimes use a phone?</i> e. <i>Who knows how to send an SMS? Show me.</i> f. <i>What is useful about an SMS?</i> g. <i>What are all the features on your phone that you use? (Prompt later: clock, alarm clock, torch, calculator, phone book, log of calls.)</i> h. <i>Who knows how to check the balance of the phone?</i> i. <i>Who know how to complain at the phone company?</i> j. <i>Show a tablet. Ask them "have you ever seen this?"</i> k. <i>Give them some time to play around with it. See whether they can get it to switch on. See whether they can make the menu work.</i> l. <i>Finally, ask them: "how do you feel using technology? Would you like the group to use more technology?"</i> 		

Focus Group Discussions with Savings Groups		Theme: Technology	Name Innovation: e-recording
Date:	Number of participants:		
Partner:	Study location:		
Hypotheses to test (still check formulation)	<i>Probe questions</i>		<i>Notes</i>
2. Group members are capable of explaining the benefits of the technology used and how it improves their group workings	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Ask them to show you how the e-recording works. During the demonstration, observe carefully to what extent each person there really understands. b. Ask them to explain the purpose of the technology (e-recording) that they are using. c. Probe with questions: e.g. "how is it better than without e-recording." d. What is the feature that you most appreciate? e. When summarizing results, particularly indicate whether all the group members could explain the way the e-recording works and could describe its benefits. 		
3. In which ways can the e-recording application still be improved?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. So, do you have any suggestions about how to improve this application? 		
4. Would they recommend the use of e-recording to others?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. So, imagine you have a friend who wants to start a group. This person asks you about your experiences with this group. What would you advise him/her? b. If they do not mention e-recording, prompt them by asking whether they would advise that also? c. In which situations would you not advise the use of e-recording? 		
5. Group members are prepared to pay a modest fee for the technology tool, once it has proven directly useful to them	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. So, are you planning to continue using e-recording? b. Now of course, the people who developed e-recording, they also need to earn money. So if you have to pay USD10 for using e-recording next cycle, would you agree? 		
Address any other ideas or questions raised			

Annex 5: List of initiatives found through preliminary search

#	Name of initiative	Location	Description of innovation	Stage of devt	Orgs involved	Comments	
						Analyst	Senior Researcher/ Team Leader
1	PSP delivery channel (original)	Kenya, Uganda, Tanzania	Groups pay certified local agents for facilitation	Completed	CRS and local NGOs/FBOs	Good initiative that lays a good foundation for later initiatives.	Potentially a great way of reaching far more people with same budget.
2	PSP with e-recording ⁴	Kenya-Eldoret, Ahero	Groups use smartphones for book keeping supported by PSP	Completed	CRS/ Software Group/ FSD, CARE Int'l and local NGOs/FBOs	Fantastic innovation that will eliminate the paper based reliance.	Fewer errors, easier to train on accounting, a way of easily enforcing group-rules. Probably reduces risks of late payment of loans or non-payment of interest or fines.
3	Modification of e-recording	Kenya	Potential of linking to MIS and providing data for credit scoring of group members	Being developed	CRS/Software Group/FSD, CARE Int'l and local NGOs/FBOs	Forward thinking, as members will manufacture individual credit scores for future borrowings with FIs.	
4	E-kit	Kenya	Electronic training guides on training SGs to be available for downloading on smartphones. To be used in combination with face-to-face training or separately without any facilitator.	About to implement	FSD/Software Group/CRS	Very useful and will standardize the quality of group trainings without the need of a trainer	Very worthwhile, giving this a try. One of the first forms of "broadcasting" instead of face-to-face approaches.
5	M-chama ⁵	Kenya	SGs linkage with a FI to bank surplus savings from group meetings to a bank account via three channels- bank branch, bank agent or mobile money agent. Linkage of member accounts to the group accounts and transfer of funds between the accounts possible simplifying savings contributions, shareouts etc.	Still being developed, it is quite an advanced application	FSD/ Postbank	Should be running already, as there is great potential there! Groups will readily embrace this, especially the transfer of excess funds to their account via m-pesa.	This is an all-encompassing solution for 'spontaneous' groups, like ROSCA and ASCA that were started outside of NGO facilitation, as well as the VSLA/SILC etc groups that were or will be started by NGOs.

⁴ http://www.fsdkenya.org/updates/13-09-16_FSD_Updates_SGs_e-Recording_issue08.pdf

⁵ <http://conferencenews.online.co.ke/m-chama-mobile-banking-introduced-by-bank-of-africa-and-safaricom/>

#	Name of initiative	Location	Description of innovation	Stage of devt	Orgs involved	Comments	
						Analyst	Senior Researcher/ Team Leader
6	Tigo Susu Live service ⁶	Ghana	<p>The Tigo Market Women Project (MWP) is a financial empowerment project through which Tigo Ghana, offers access to a more secure savings scheme and convenient access to other financial services. 'Susu' is a local parlance for micro savings; one of the oldest forms of financial transaction. This system allows people to save money with a trusted individual by making daily deposits, which they access after an agreed period of time. This is usually monthly, quarterly or annually. The major risk associated with this kind of micro financing/savings has been the disappearance of some trustees with people's life savings. The Tigo Cash Market Women's project was developed to solve this age-old problem.</p> <p>The innovation empowers women via technology. Tigo Ghana gives a digital twist to the traditional Ghanaian "Susu" method of saving money, using an innovative mobile financial services plan to allow women to keep ownership of their savings.</p>	Completed	Millicom/ Tigo/CGAP	Has been nominated for the 2014 Global Mobile Award for "Best Mobile Product or Service for Women in Emerging Markets"!	
7	ChamaPesa ⁷	East Africa	A software platform that provides access to savings instruments on the phone. Members save and purchase shares on the phone. The consolidated amounts are banked and the group can undertake	On-going	ChamaPesa	The app needs intensive training to the users. The semi-literate may have problems operating it	Very interesting that it is an initiative without donor money or international NGOs/FSD, etc. We should contact these

⁶ <http://www.cgap.org/blog/understanding-customers-financial-innovation-ghana>

⁷ <http://www.dinero.sc/>
<https://vc4africa.biz/ventures/dinero-social-savings-system-chamapesa/>

#	Name of initiative	Location	Description of innovation	Stage of devt	Orgs involved	Comments	
						Analyst	Senior Researcher/ Team Leader
			investments in the stock market, small businesses, real estate. The mission is to improve the quality of the chama system by enabling access to diverse savings instruments with better governance and reliability through mobile phones				for sure.
8	eMoney Pool ⁸	US	<p>This online tool facilitates the creation of money pools without the tedium of face-to-face money. It leverages modern technology, allowing people to create their own private money pools among friends and family anywhere in the United States.</p> <p>Groups can join their funds and then take turns benefiting from the money in the pool, rather than pooling in the traditional, hassle-filled way, of pool banking. EMoneyPool allows an online setup and transfer process eliminating the risk and inefficiency of carrying large sums of money back and forth between people and banks. (Steps are being taken to evolve further to also serve as a bridge between their under-banked customers and formal lending institutions. The data will be sent directly to select lending institutions which will create a positive payment history for users and an ability for borrowers and lenders to connect who might otherwise be off each other's radar screens.)</p>	On-going	eMoneyPool	Works a bit like the Tigo MWP in Ghana	It sounds more like a ROSCA technology style. Definitely need to interview them and also investigate their intention to reach other countries, namely African countries.

⁸ http://poptech.org/e5_francisco_cervera
<http://aztechbeat.com/2013/06/emoneypool-helping-the-underserved-access-capital/>

#	Name of initiative	Location	Description of innovation	Stage of devt	Orgs involved	Comments	
						Analyst	Senior Researcher/ Team Leader
9	Sending group contributions via mobile money ⁹	Kenya	Group members contribute their savings by sending them either to the treasurer's phone or to the beneficiary of the day. It is however practiced autonomously by groups (I am in one such group where we do not meet often but send money to the beneficiary of the month.)	Completed	M-Pesa	M-pesa most commonly used for these transfers	
10	mCollector ¹⁰	Kenya	A group collects money from each member and M-pesas to the MFI and the Loan officer logs onto mCollector and sees expected repayment and inputs actual repayment collected: One transaction cost. mCollector links to a mini printer and group gets a physical receipt instantly. Each member gets a SMS confirming payment. mCollector is linked to the bank's software system.	Completed	Software Group/ MFIs e.g. Micro Africa	Fantastic! Especially the print out and individual SMS confirmations.	This is very interesting to investigate further. Potentially, we can compare effectiveness of this receipt printing form to those forms of sending digitally to groups without getting a receipt.
11	MyROSCA(<i>MiTanda</i>) ¹¹	Mexico	Bank takes the role of a ROSCA organizer. Clients choose ROSCA members and the number or rounds. The bank tracks savings records and uses them to offer credit to ROSCA members as well as other incentives and prizes.	On-going	Bancomer/ IDEO.org		Very interesting. I will interview them. Kifiya in Ethiopia is intending to develop this same type of product for Equb, which is same as ROSCA.
12	Beat the bank ¹²	Uganda	Team members support each other in achieving their savings goals and win rewards from the bank. Members each set their own savings goal amount, but the goals must be reached in the same timeframe for	Completed	MTN This idea did not materialize and there is no further	MTN did not see the product as a money maker. MTN felt, however, that it could be a good tool for promotion. Some MTN	This is a type of commitment saving initiative. I am not sure if MCF intends this to be within scope of the project. I would

⁹ This initiative does not have a specific name.

¹⁰ http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=YM8ysl_R57c

¹¹ <http://www.cgap.org/news/open-ip-platform-other-api-concepts-mexico>

¹² <http://www.cgap.org/news/open-ip-platform-other-api-concepts-uganda>

#	Name of initiative	Location	Description of innovation	Stage of devt	Orgs involved	Comments	
						Analyst	Senior Researcher/ Team Leader
			<p>the whole team.</p> <p>If everyone reaches their goal in time they "beat the bank" and the bank pays out a tangible reward. If any team member fails to reach their goal, no reward is paid.</p> <p>The whole team is notified if any members are falling behind. Team members can contribute to others' goals to help them along.</p>		information.	<p>team members also felt that the key to "progress" for Ugandans is not to save together but rather to build up their own credit histories. As a result, the product scored low on sustainability.</p>	definitely like to investigate.
13	M-Changa ¹³	Kenya	<p>SMS- based platform that enables individuals to raise money and to reach others who can send their contributions via the mobile phone. Allows tracking of payments and the money can be withdrawn any time.</p>	Complete	M-Changa/ M-Pesa/ Airtel Money/ Paypal	<p>Can be customized to group savings that can be sent to the member receiving the day's contributions</p> <p>Originally, for raising money for life-cycle events like funeral expenses, weddings, dowry. Send SMS to people you know to request for funds.</p>	
14	Chamapro ¹⁴	Kenya	<p>A platform that helps informal financial self-help groups and savings clubs digitize their information management and record keeping</p>	???	???	<p>Not much information save the fact that it was nominated for Pivot 2012 financial services category award.</p>	
15	Jamobi ¹⁵	Kenya	<p>A mobile software solution that allows members of the informal sector to effectively manage their economic activities from their mobile device at a cheap cost.</p>	On-going	OTB (Outside the Box)- Software Development Company	<p>Piloted with 100 traders at Gikomba but there is no further information after the piloting.</p>	
16	Simple MFI ¹⁶	Kenya, Available	<p>It holds information about clients, groups, loans, transactions and</p>	Completed	Manta Sync-developer	<p>Simple App that can be customized for SGs.</p>	Again, very interesting that it was developed

¹³ <http://www.changa.co.ke/>

¹⁴ <http://www.pivoteast.com/semi-finalists-2012/>

¹⁵ <http://www.pivoteast.com/semi-finalists-2012/>

¹⁶ <https://play.google.com/store/apps/details?id=org.simplemfi.app&hl=en>

#	Name of initiative	Location	Description of innovation	Stage of devt	Orgs involved	Comments	
						Analyst	Senior Researcher/ Team Leader
		for downloading on Google play	passbook data, and is designed to replace the paper ledgers. The data needed by Simple MFI is copied locally on to the phone, and the app works just fine without Internet connectivity. Synchronization of schedules is controlled by the user, and can be set up to keep airtime costs low.				without donor money (or this seems to be the case).
17	M-Pesa accounts for VSLAs ¹⁷	Tanzania	The VSLAs open an M-Pesa account as a group, and use it for the safe storage of excess funds.	Completed	Vodacom/ CARE		This would also be an initiative we could study.
18	Linking SGs to FIs near the end of the cycle ¹⁸	Tajikistan	Bank account opened in the name of one official who can deposit and withdraw funds. When deposits are made, the bank receipt is entered in the savings book, which is required during withdrawals. The receipt and savings book are locked in the group cash-box	Completed	Mountain Societies Development Support Programme (MSDSP)/ Ahmonatbank	Risky to open and operate the account in one member's name	
19	"Socialize savings" ¹⁹	Rwanda	Members make payments, through their mobile phones, that automatically update their individual bank balances. Combines the social strength of an informal club with the safety of a bank and the convenience of a mobile phone.	Completed	Frog/ Visa	A prototype for mVisa. Members meet during group meetings but instead of contributing to a pool, they send their individual contributions to their individual savings accounts.	
20	mVisa ²⁰	Rwanda	Allows the bank's clients to easily access their bank's account via their phone and also helps encourage	Completed	Bank of Kigali/ Visa/ Urwego		

¹⁷ http://www.seepnetwork.org/filebin/pdf/savings_led_working_group/Frontier_Book_Chapter_3_DRAFT.pdf

¹⁸ http://www.seepnetwork.org/filebin/pdf/savings_led_working_group/Frontier_Book_Chapter_3_DRAFT.pdf

¹⁹ <http://designmind.frogdesign.com/articles/think-again/modern-banking-comes-to-rwanda.html>

<http://designmind.frogdesign.com/articles/think-again/modern-banking-comes-to-rwanda.html>

²⁰ <http://allafrica.com/stories/201307291891.html?viewall=1>

<http://allafrica.com/stories/201307291891.html>

<http://allafrica.com/stories/201307291891.html?viewall=1>

#	Name of initiative	Location	Description of innovation	Stage of devt	Orgs involved	Comments	
						Analyst	Senior Researcher/ Team Leader
			non- account holders, mainly rural people, to be bankable. It is an interoperable mobile branchless banking solution. It can service account holders from any other financial services provider in the country.		Opportunity Bank		
21	e-kulki	Cartagena , Colombia	The VSLA-style groups of Fundación Plan will completely operate cash-less, via Ahorro a la Mano, a mobile wallet. Due to the data track of all these transactions, e-kulki will be able to provide each group all the accounting and enforcing of the group's constitution. Facilitates groups formation (less training needed); reduces risk of theft (from within the group and from outside),and; can potentially stimulate more sophisticated group rules.	Started to implemented (2 groups formed)	e-kulki (small start-up firm), Fundación Plan, Compartamos, ANSPE (ministry for alleviating extreme poverty)		Combination of e-recording and m-money style initiative. More complex but potentially more impact and growth aspect.
22	e-kulki's e-juego	Colombia	Game developed to simulate the full experience and results of participating in a SG. During the game, members play savings and loans rounds quite quickly, so that in one morning, they can play 16 group meetings, equivalent to an 8 month timeframe in real life. The game functions roughly like monopoly, with each player being confronted with a certain set of situations at each round. In some rounds there are windfalls, in others, there are emergencies and very hard financial situations. Throughout the game, saving is rewarded. The player with the highest savings at share-out will be the winner.	Idea (design has been prepared, software stage not yet)	e-kulki		It is potentially very effective, particularly for people who are hesitant to join and want to wait until they understand and see what the benefits are.

#	Name of initiative	Location	Description of innovation	Stage of devt	Orgs involved	Comments	
						Analyst	Senior Researcher/ Team Leader
23	e-kulki income model	Colombia	The SGs will be linked to a market research firm. They will give feedback about any new products, consumer behavior, testing products, conducting group discussions about consumer preferences, etc. etc. If this works out, the group will have fun and they will earn enough from this activity to pay for all the software and money transfer costs.	Idea (has been designed to a certain level)	e-kulki		Requires a large volume of respondents. This is why e-kulki cannot implement this yet.
24	SfC (saving for change) Linking SGs to formal financial institutions and appropriate mobile money products	Burkina Faso and Benin	To improve financial access of the very poor by providing them with a broader range of affordable and appropriate financial services. Straightforward bank linkage.	Completed	Freedom from Hunger, local NGOs, MCF		It forms part of a larger programme of innovations
25	Text and voice financial education messages for women and youth	Burkina Faso and Benin	To build the financial capability of women and youth in savings and credit programs through text and voice messages sent to their mobile phones.	Completed	Freedom from Hunger, local NGOs, MCF		Potentially interesting to study.
26	Linking Savings Groups to health providers	Burkina Faso and Benin	To improve the health and resilience of the very poor by providing them with access to appropriate health services (however, it is not clear how it works).	Completed	Freedom from Hunger, local NGOs, MCF, those providing health care		Probably outside the scope of the project.
27	M-training Tools for village	Burkina Faso and Benin	Training to illiterate women about forming SGs. Theoretically, people could start their own SG with this	Completed	Freedom from Hunger, local NGOs,		It looks good, but you wonder how effective this can be when using

#	Name of initiative	Location	Description of innovation	Stage of devt	Orgs involved	Comments	
						Analyst	Senior Researcher/ Team Leader
	women		training, meaning no more face-to-face time is needed. ²¹		MCF		really simple feature phone with these tiny screens and (usually) low quality sound.
28	E-learning Supervision Course for NGO staff	Burkina Faso and Benin	Repeat trainings are recorded and can then be offered to various local NGOs to train and retrain their staff. To build the capacity of local NGO supervisors in a cost-effective manner through e-learning.	Completed	Freedom from Hunger, MCF		This particularly sounds useful as these NGOs should have access to reasonably good video display equipment and the NGO staff could also use it as a way to support discussions and self-training.
29	Mobile data collection of social indicators for NGO staff	Benin and Burkina Faso	To more efficiently and accurately monitor program outcomes using the Progress Out of Poverty Index (PPI), Food Security Survey (FSS) and business and social capital indicators.	Completed	Freedom from Hunger, MCF		This sounds also very interesting and may have other applications.
30	Commitment savings	Colombia	Group members go through a process of pledging their savings goals (height and purpose) and explain if they do not achieve this goal within the cycle of the group. The result is that people manage to save much more.	About to be completed	IED/Vital/City Uni of New York		It is an easy addition to make the group's effectiveness deeper. Not sure if within scope of this assignment.
31	Franchise model	Kenya	Through franchise holders, group promoters are trained on a payment basis (promoters paid by groups, franchise holders by CARE?). It is results-based payment. This model is particularly successful at reaching out to difficult to reach "pockets" of people, e.g. sex-workers, minorities.	Completed	CARE Kenya, Access Africa, BoC		It is a model very similar to Private Service Providers of CRS but with an additional level. Where CRS works with local dioceses, CARE works with business women/men.
32	Group excess savings on a	Kenya	Full details not available.	Completed	CARE Kenya, Access Africa, Orange,		It is thought to be quite successful.

²¹ <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=JUkcCPeb-PA&feature=youtu.be>

#	Name of initiative	Location	Description of innovation	Stage of devt	Orgs involved	Comments	
						Analyst	Senior Researcher/ Team Leader
	mobile wallet, with group-wallets/Equity bank accounts				Equity		
33	Bank linkage with Barclays	Kenya	Full details not available.	Completed	CARE Kenya, Banking on Change, Access Africa		Not sure whether successful.
34	Tablet / smartphone registration	Colombia	Provides bookkeeping support with an application to record transactions and calculate group totals.	Completed	IED/Vital, Grameen Foundation		Don't know any details.
35	Storing excess group savings on a mobile wallet (Ahorro a la mano)	Colombia	A simple bank-linkage to a mobile wallet offered by a bank.	Completed?	IED/Vital, Bancolombia		Don't know any details. Not sure if they managed to develop a group account (e-kulki is not able to achieve that)
36	Usage of local people to support the paid group facilitators (these people are not paid)	Colombia	It is a model where scale is added by making use of volunteers.	Completed?	IED/Vital		Don't know any details. It sounds very much like a Plan-type version of PSP.
37	Micro businesses	Colombia	Groups and group-members get access to various forms of franchises, including distribution for large firms, and micro-franchises (either run by individuals or by groups)	Ongoing	IED/Vital		Don't know much detail.
38	Drop a tablet in a village and	Colombia and other Latam	A tablet is loaded with financial education applications and lent to a household in a village. They get 1	Completed?	Fundación Capital		A very interesting model that can be copied for a range of

#	Name of initiative	Location	Description of innovation	Stage of devt	Orgs involved	Comments	
						Analyst	Senior Researcher/ Team Leader
	see what happens	countries	months to play around with it, while the tablet tracks what they do with it. It is offered without any explanation how it works or what it is for. The amount that people can just find out for themselves and teach themselves this way is amazing. Currently, it is not really focused on SGs.				educational tools. If well-designed, people will find their way around information available on a tablet.
39	Barclays Bank Linkage	Uganda	Groups open a savings account at their local Barclays branch and, with time, become eligible for an overdraft facility. At the beginning of 2013, 9 overdrafts had been received and no repayment delays were experienced. It would be interesting to hear the current size and experiences of this programme.	Ongoing (started in 2012)	CARE Uganda, Barclays, Banking on Change		This is successful, primarily because the bank realized that these savings are very attractive to them because predictable when they will be deposited and (importantly) exactly when they will be withdrawn. So like a term-deposit for the bank. I am sure this has progressed in the past year.
40	Oil stain	? e.g. DRC	Just train one person from a remote location to then take the methodology home and start forming groups with only distant supervision and support, e.g. in areas of conflict, dangerous regions, or simply countries that are too vast to cover.	Idea	Lauren Hendricks Access Africa mentioned this		This sounds very interesting and worth testing out in countries where it is unlikely any organization will be able to offer their more blanket-like approach.
41	Village Agent model	Zambia (and other countries)	First, paid staff will form groups, then from the group members the most appropriate people are selected to be trained as facilitators who will not be paid, but will receive fees from the groups.	Completed	Plan Zambia		It worked well, but there remains always an issue with groups not liking to pay for facilitation by a local person after the first groups were formed

#	Name of initiative	Location	Description of innovation	Stage of devt	Orgs involved	Comments	
						Analyst	Senior Researcher/ Team Leader
							free-of-charge by professionals.
42	SaveAct Financial Education	South Africa	They use financial education as an integral tool of group formation and group support. This education will soon be reinforced with mobile phone messaging mechanism. Partnerships are still being developed for this.	Idea	Save Act		It would at least be interesting to also cover an initiative in South Africa. Otherwise it does not sound too innovative the way it is currently operating.
43	Kifiya Equb services	Ethiopia	This new financial technology company (with plans to start branchless banking and mobile-wallet products) is intending to provide existing Equbs (ROSCA) with a secure and fair system of administration and secure payment channel.	Idea	Kifiya		In Ethiopia 70% of the people are member of an Edir (type of funeral insurance group) and 40% of Equb (ROSCA in a large range of forms).
44	Village Agents/ Community volunteers	Throughout Africa	A slightly different approach to CRS's Private Service Providers. In this arrangement, paid staff first form groups from which potential facilitators are selected and trained as volunteers. These volunteers are expected to raise some payment from the groups.	Currently in operation in this form for some time.	Plan		I have researched this approach when evaluating Banking on Change programme. The difference with the CRS approach described here was then found also to be the weakness of this approach: it was very hard for groups to accept to pay for the services of one of their colleague villagers while some groups got their formation from a professional for free.
45	IMA Inter-group Marketing Associations	Tanzania	Several groups intermediate money between them and assist each other with training and social action.	Longstanding initiative	Plan TZ		It is certainly a different way of working with groups, but it is not clear whether it actually touches on one of the

#	Name of initiative	Location	Description of innovation	Stage of devt	Orgs involved	Comments	
						Analyst	Senior Researcher/ Team Leader
							three dimensions here. These IMAs are having a bank account with Barclays (but mixed success) and otherwise they do not particularly grow rapidly, do not use technology. In theory it could provide an interesting model that several groups jointly have a bank account which may reduce the travel and transactions costs across the groups.
46	KWFT and Equity ASCA groups	Kenya	Groups are stimulated or linked to KWFT and Equity the way other groups are linked to CARE who stimulated them to start as a group. This is mentioned in Susan Johnson's 2012 report, "The Rift Revealed," and is based on FinScope data.	Probably several years because it showed up in FinScope study 2012	KWFT, Equity		This is potentially interesting to study as these appear to be initiated by banks. It can serve as a model for other banks.

Annex 6: Materials Consulted

Websites:

<http://www.cgap.org/news/open-ip-platform-other-api-concepts-mexico>
<http://www.cgap.org/blog/understanding-customers-financial-innovation-ghana>
<http://www.cgap.org/news/reaching-base-pyramid-mexico-atms-beat-out-mobile>
<http://www.dinero.sc/>
<https://vc4africa.biz/ventures/dinero-social-savings-system-chamapesa/>
http://poptech.org/e5_francisco_cervera
<http://aztechbeat.com/2013/06/emoneypool-helping-the-underserved-access-capital/>
http://www.fsdkenya.org/newsletters/11-07-26_FSD-Newsletter-issue-no.17.pdf
http://www.fsdkenya.org/updates/13-09-16_FSD_Updates_SGs_e-Recording_issue08.pdf
http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=YM8ysl_R57c
<http://www.pivoteast.com/semi-finalists-2012/>
<https://play.google.com/store/apps/details?id=org.simplemfi.app&hl=en>
http://www.seepnetwork.org/filebin/pdf/savings_led_working_group/Frontier_Book_Chapter_3_DRAFT.pdf
http://www.seepnetwork.org/filebin/pdf/savings_led_working_group/Frontier_Book_Chapter_3_DRAFT.pdf
http://www.fsdkenya.org/updates/13-09-16_FSD_Updates_SGs_e-Recording_issue08.pdf
<http://investeddevelopment.com/blog/2012/05/how-mobile-technology-improves-informal-savings-groups/>
<http://investeddevelopment.com/wp-content/uploads/2012/05/Improving-Informal-Savings-Groups-with-Mobile-Technology.pdf>
<http://designmind.frogdesign.com/articles/think-again/modern-banking-comes-to-rwanda.html>
<http://allafrica.com/stories/201307291891.html>
<http://allafrica.com/stories/201307291891.html?viewall=1>
<http://www.cgap.org/news/open-ip-platform-other-api-concepts-uganda>

Literature:

Role of Informal Financial Groups in Kenya, Susan Johnson and Max Nino-Zarazua, 2009
Delivering technology solutions to susu collectors, Loretta Michaels, CGAP, 2012
Dinero Social Savings System: ChamaPesa – Product Launch, 2013
The Search for Inclusion in Kenya’s Financial Landscape : the rift revealed, Susan Johnson et al, FSD, 2012
No More Tears: FSD Updates, September 2013
From Informal Microfinance to Linkage Banking: Putting Theory into Practice, and Practice into Theory, Hans Dieter Seibel, 2006
The Evolution Of Financial Cooperatives In Nigeria: Do They Have A Place In Financial Intermediation? M.T. Marx, H.D. Seibel, 2012
Financial Cooperatives – What Role For Government? The Rise And Fall Of The Credit Cooperative System In India, H.D. Seibel, 2013
Old and New Worlds of Microfinance in Europe and Asia, Hans Dieter Seibel, In: Aditya Goenka and David Henley (eds), Southeast Asia’s Credit Revolution: From Moneylenders to Microfinance, London: Routledge, 2010, pp. 40-57
NABARD’s Tablet-based MIS for SHGs (or Village Banks), H.D. Seibel, 2014
Proposal for Airtel Chama, May 2013
Prototypes de Produits YouthStart I (West Africa)
Youth Economic Empowerment, an integrated approach addressing youth poverty in Niger, Senegal & Sierra Leone, 2009
Saving for Change, Overview of E-learning Tools, Freedom From Hunger, September 2013
Open IP Platform: Other API, Concepts in Mexico, CGAP, July 2013
Banking on Change Project Proposal Phase II, 2012 (started in 2013)
Alternative Financial Vehicles: Rotating Savings and Credit Associations (ROSCAs), Christy Chung Hevener, Federal Reserve Bank of Philadelphia, November 2006
Why use ROSCAs when you can use banks? - Theory, and evidence from Ethiopia, Abbi M. Kedir, Univ. of Leicester, Richard Disney, University Nottingham, Indraneel Dasgupta, Centre for Studies in Social Sciences,

Kolkata, 2011
Accelerated Project Proposal for BMGF, Airtel Uganda, 2013
mWomen Project- Airtel VSLA Product, Baseline FGD results and draft commercial model findings, February 2014, Grameen Foundation
Deep Outreach Financial Inclusion: Savings Groups for Those Microfinance Can't Reach, Jeffrey Ashe, 2013
The Service Provider Spectrum – From Microfinance to Financial Inclusion, Joanna Ledgerwood, 2013
La mise en relation des jeunes avec les institutions de micro finance, Plan, PAMECAS, 2013
NABARD's SHG Accounting and MIS – Case Study, 2013
Paul Rippey, presentation at Zambia Savings Group workshop.
CPE Rwanda 2010, Working Paper Rural Finance, H.D. Seibel, 2010, IFAD
Village Savings and Loan Associations -- experience from Zanzibar, EZRA ANYANGO, EZEKIEL ESIPISU, LYDIA OPOKU, SUSAN JOHNSON, MARKKU MALKAMAKI and CHRIS MUSOKE, 2006
Connecting the world's poorest people to the global economy – new models for linking informal savings groups to formal financial services, CARE, 2013
Results of Study of Post-Project Replication of Groups in COSALO I, Digital Divide Data, 2011
Unconventional Partnerships in Mobile Technology, Powerpoint presentation, Dimagi, Enclude, Grameen Foundation, 2013
<i>In</i> Focus Note 3: Combining demand and supply side insights to build a better proposition for banks and clients, Bankable Frontiers Associates, May 2012
Focus Note 1: Outcompeting the Lockbox – Linking Savings Groups to the Formal Financial Sector, Bankable Frontiers Associates, 2014
Focus Note 2: SLG Linkages – The Case for a Bank-MNO Partnership Bankable Frontiers Associates, 2014
Linking Savings Groups to the Formal Financial Sector, Bankable Frontiers Associates, 2013
<u>Digitizing Savings Circles for the Base of the Pyramid: Bringing a centuries-old concept into the digital age</u> , Alina Kogan and Rishabh Khosla, March 2014
Post Project Replication of Savings Groups in Uganda, Datu Research, 2013
Freedom From Hunger, Savings For Change, Brief, 2012
Press Release, Acción Venture Lab, eMoneyPool, 2014
PSP Manual, CRS, 2013
Understanding Customers for Financial Innovation in Ghana, Yanina Seltzer, Claudia McKay, CGAP, 2014